

## **Subtitle Accuracy for Children in Translating Cartoon from English into Indonesia**

**Lilik Istiqomah<sup>1\*</sup>, Nada Nur Azizah, Farah Mufidah Rahmah**

<sup>1\*</sup>Institut Agama Islam Negeri (IAIN) Surakarta  
<sup>1\*</sup>mdcorp100@gmail.com

**Abstract.** *The objectives of the research are to classify the accuracy in translating cartoon from English to Indonesian subtitles, to determine the accuracy and readability of translating English to Indonesian subtitles of Tayo Cartoon movie by the amateur translator. This research is a descriptive qualitative method. Data of this research are utterances or sentences in subtitle movies of the bilingual edition, both English and Indonesian. Meanwhile, the source of the data is Tayo Cartoon movie. In analyzing the data, researchers used a comparison method to compare Source Language (SL) and Target Language (TL). This research shows that the subtitle made by the subtitling class students as the amateur translator acceptable for the children with some reconciliation from SL into TL. In conclusion, it can be concluded that the translation quality of Tayo Cartoon movie by the subtitling class students as the amateur translator is accurate.*

**Keywords:** *accuracy; amateur translator; cartoon; subtitle; translation*

### **A. INTRODUCTION**

Nowadays, translating is not only done by translation practitioners but also by many amateur translators. In this process, the translators usually use some procedures in translating language. A good translator has to choose the suitable procedures to translate from one language into another language. From a good way in determining compatible procedures, it can obtain acceptable, readable, and accuracy of the translation product. Talking about translation means talking about subtitles. The translation is dealing with the document or written text; meanwhile, subtitle is dealing with audiovisual text. A good subtitle facilitated the audience to understand more the content of a movie (Istiqomah, Nurwidayati, N., & Atiqotul, A, 2019). Focus of this paper is analyzing the procedures used by amateur

translators in subtitling of a movie especially a cartoon movie. Target audience of this movie is children. They do not read subtitles as adults do, especially when watching cartoons, which usually are “action-oriented” films (d'Ydewale et al. 1991 cited in Karamitroglou 2000:118). Children most focus on the picture of character they watch in a movie, so the subtitle must be fast reading and there is no difficulties for reading in a concise time. Translating cartoons, especially for children, is in a way different from translating films for adults due to the different functions and features of films (Istiqomah, L., Rohimah, A., & Pratiwi, A., 2019). This paper presents an analytical study on the accuracy in translating Tayo Cartoon by amateur translators.

### ***Accuracy in Translation***

There are some standard quality of caption includes readability, compressibility, and accuracy (Alex Varley and Chris Howe,2014:14). This reseach focused on the accuracy of caption. Alex Varley and Chris Howe (2014:8) stated that accuracy is caption should reflect the dialogue and be correctly spelled and punctuated. FCC (2014:12) also stated that accurate in caption must match the spoken words in the dialogue and convey background noises and other sounds to the fullest extent possible. Even though, according to Neves (2008), captioning is not only display words as the text equivalent of spoken dialogue or narration but also included speaker identification and sound effect. It can be said that the accuracy of caption is the reader can catch the meaning of the subtitle precisely the same as it's the dialogue. Caption not only conveys the speaker's dialogue but also conveys the speaker's identification background or sound effect.

Pablo in Alex Varley and Chris Howe (2014:17) state about the rating scale of accuracy as follows in the table:

Table.1: Rating Score of Accuracy

The Category of Caption	Score	Parameters Qualitative
Accurate	3	Accurate is the source sentence's content is accurately transferred into the target sentences; both the source language and the target language can communicate the same meaning and equivalent with the source language.
Less Accurate	2	Less accurate caption is the content of source language transferred less accurately into the target language. There is still meaning not transferred into the target language.
Inaccurate	1	An inaccurate caption is a change the meaning of the text. The sentences or source language are not accurately transferred to the target language.

Based on the description above, it can be concluded that a caption is said to be accurate if both the source language and the target language can communicate the same and equivalent meaning. Moreover, accurate caption if it identifies speakers, indicates simple sound effects, and does consistently

## **B. METHOD**

The study of this research uses a descriptive qualitative method. Researchers only collected, classified, analyzed the data, and then drew conclusion and verification. This research described the accuracy in translating of Tayo Cartoon by amateur translators and applied descriptive qualitative method in this research. Miles and Hubberman (1994:9) state that qualitative research data are mostly words. It means the language is extended text. The words are based on observation, interviews, or documents.

Data of this research is manuscript of dialogue and the caption on many screens of the cartoon. The manuscript and caption of the cartoon is a product of amateur translators in Subtitling Class of Islamic University in Surakarta. The secondary data of this research are taken from the information given by the rates and the target readers. The Source of the data is Tayo Cartoon that contained Indonesian subtitles by amateur translators as a product of the Subtitling Practice study. There are 147 utterances in the Tayo Cartoon.

Researchers act as the main instrument in qualitative research (Moleong, 2004: 163). Technique of collecting the data will be described as follows.

1. Downloading the soft files or copies of the four English textbooks from the internet
2. Reading dialogues where requests take place, including the information about the dialogues, very comprehensively.
3. Selecting the data
4. Classifying the data
5. Transferring the data into tables
6. Analyzing and interpreting the data

Researchers classified the accuracy of caption based on the level. There are three parameters to classify the accuracy of caption i.e.: accurate, less accurate and inaccurate. Two raters give mark/ score to each data based on the rating system that has been mentioned in chapter three. We makes a calculation and find the average score from the first group. The average score is used to classify the accuracy of caption into three categories bellow: a. Accurate caption (consist of the data which

the average score 2,66-3,00); b. Less Accurate caption (consist of the data which the average score 1,34-2,65); c. Inaccurate caption (consist of the data which average score 1,00-,00).

### **C. FINDING**

#### Accuracy Caption

Caption is accurate if both the source language and the target language can communicate the same meaning, the target language is equivalent to the source language. This part discusses the accuracy of caption in the movie. There are two types of caption; verbatim and edited caption. Verbatim is word for word subtitles. This type is for viewers who has high reading rates. In doing captioning, it needs an editing stage. It is a short cutting process to make a caption readable, easy, and faster to be read. Editing can add or miss some elements to make the caption meaningful and acceptable as the viewers easy to read while enjoying the movie. Editing also means getting the clear meaning of caption so that it can be suitable and proper for the deaf and hard of hearing.

Researchers created a classification of accurate caption to know the caption is good or not. Below are the classification data:

#### a. Accurate Caption

The sentences are included inaccurate caption if the source sentences' content is accurately transferred into the target sentences. The content of the source sentence is equivalent and equal to the target sentence. Moreover, Caption is accurate if both the data source language and target language can communicate the same meaning with the text source. There is no changing in meaning from the source language into the target language. From all the dialogues, 136 data have accurate caption. As it is shown at the dialogue number 14.

b. Less Accurate

Less accurate is the content of the source language transferred less accurately into target language. Some meanings are not delivered into the target language accurately. From all the dialogues, there are 11 that have less accurate caption. As it is shown in the example of the dialogue number 32.

c. Inaccurate Caption

The caption is inaccurate if the captions written in the screens of the movie are those which change the meaning of the source text into the target text. The sentences or the text of the source language are not accurately transferred into the target language. The researchers did not found the number of caption's data is inaccurate.

Table.2: Data from the subtitle text transcription

No	Accurate Caption Category	Data
1.	Accurate	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9, 10, 11, 13, 14, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37, 38, 39, 40, 41, 42, 43, 45, 46, 47, 48, 49, 50, 51, 52, 53, 54, 55, 56, 57, 58, 59, 60, 61, 62, 64, 65, 66, 67, 68, 69, 70, 71, 73, 74, 75, 76, 77, 78, 79, 80, 81, 82, 83, 84, 85, 86, 87, 88, 89, 90, 91, 92, 93, 94, 95, 96, 97, 98, 100, 101, 102, 103, 104, 105, 106, 107, 108, 109, 110, 111, 112, 113, 114, 115, 116, 117, 118, 119, 120, 121, 122, 123, 124, 125, 126, 127,128,129,130,131,132,133,134,135,136,137,138, 139, 141, 142, 143, 144, 145, 146, 147
2.	Less Accurate	2, 8, 12, 15, 31, 32, 44, 63, 72, 99, 140
3.	In Accurate	-

After all of the utterances of the cartoon has been scripted and analyzed, the data then was divided into three terms, which were accurate, less accurate and in accurate caption. The classification was displayed on the table.02 above. From the table. 02 we can find accurate caption of the Tayo Cartoon was 136 and less accurate caption was 11 captions. Here, we had not found inaccurate caption on the Tayo Cartoon that translates by the amateur translators.

#### **D. DISCUSSION**

The subtitle on the cartoon movie should be acceptable for the children as the main target of cartoon movie production.

##### *Accurate*

For example data no 14/Tayo Cartoon/2018

SL : There was an accident in the crossroad.

TL : *Ada kecelakaan di persimpangan jalan.*

The subtitle text on sentence “Ada kecelakaan di persimpangan jalan” from the source text “There was an accident in the crossroad” is good and clear for the children as the main target who watching this cartoon. Here, the translators translated into “Ada kecelakaan di Persimpangan jalan”. The sentence was captioned word for word. The content of the source sentence is accurately transferred into the target sentence and equivalent as well as equal to the target sentence. Meaning of the target sentence is the same with the source sentence. Therefore, this caption is accurate caption. The good translator have to make the appropriate subtitle product according to who is the target viewers without changing the meaning from source language into the target language.

##### *Less Accurate*

For example, data number 32/Tayo Cartoon/2018

SL : I'll do anything that you wants to.

TL : Aku akan melakukannya apapun yang kau mau.

The Tayoo's subtitle "Aku akan melakukannya apapun yang kau mau" from the source text "I'll do anything you wants to" is good, but not acceptable enough for children. The meaning of the number 32 "Aku akan melakukannya apapun yang kau mau," the meaning of target setence is less accurate coveyed to the target sentence, it should be "Aku akan melakukan semuanya untukmu ".

#### *Inaccurate*

We had not found the inaccurate translation in the Tayo Cartoon subtitle by the amateur translator's subtitling class. Thus, It can be concluded that the amateur translators did the good translation, and they got a good score on that task.

### **E. CONCLUSION**

The result of this research shows that the subtitle of Tayo Cartoon movie made by students in subtitling class or amateur translator is acceptable for the children with some reconciliation from the SL into the TL. There are many texts that less accurate, but they do not interfere with the whole movie's contents. Therefore, it can be concluded that the translation quality of Tayo Cartoon movie by the subtitling class students as the amateur translator is accurate.

### **F. REFERENCES**

- Fadaee, E. (2011). Translation naturalness in literary works: English to Persia. *International Journal of English and Literature*. 2(9)
- Istiqomah, L., Nurwidayati, N., & Atiqotul, A. (2019). Particularization In Insidious 4: The Last Key Movie (Indonesian Subtitle). *Elite: English and Literature Journal*, 6 (1), 81-94
- Istiqomah, L., Rohimah, A., & Pratiwi, A. (2019). Slang Language Subtitle Strategy in the Movie Entitled "The Social Network". *Langkawi Journal of The Association for Arabic and English*, 5(2), 152-162
- Naraswari, S., Widara. (2015). *Translation Procedures of Culture Bound Words Used In Visitor Guide of Jawa Tengah*. Semarang



- Savitri, Y. (2018). *An Analysis of Students Translation Quality (Accuracy, Readability and Acceptability) in Translating an Informative Text Entitled Yseali to Indonesian*. Univesity of Lampung (thesis). unpublished.
- Vitari, A. (2018). *The Procedures Of Subtitling "Spectre" Movie by Two Freelance Translators*. Univesity of Sumatera Utara. Unpublished.
- Sulistiyowati, P., Anggreni, F., E. (2013). *The Translation Procedures Applied in the English Subtitle of the Indonesian Movie Entitled "The Raid"*. Brawijaya University. Unpublished.
- Szarkowska, A. (2018). *The Power of Film Translation*. Accessed on November 2, 2020. <http://translationjournal.net/journal/32film.htm>  
[www.googleresearch.blogspot.com.2018](http://www.googleresearch.blogspot.com.2018)
- Ulfah, M. (2015). *An Accuracy Analysis in Indonesian-English Translation Using "Google Translate" Machine Translation*. Walisongo State Islamic University. unpublished.

### Appendix

No .	Source text	Target text	Accuracy
1	Tayo's promise	Janji Tayo	3
2	Tayo is leting up his last passangers for today	Terakhirnya untuk hari ini Tayo menurunkan penumpang	2
3	Good bye	Sampai jumpa	3
4	Bye	Sampai jumpa	3
5	Uhhh, I'm done	Akhirnya pekerjaanku selesai	3
6	Now, I have to go to see Dory	Sekarang aku harus menemui Dory	3
7	Tayo	Tayo	3
8	Have you forget that you promise to play with me today?	Kau tidak melupakan janjimu untuk bermain denganku hari ini bukan?	2
9	Ofcourse not	Tentu saja tidak	3
10	See you at this day, see you later	Sampai jumpa di halte nanti	3

11	What to we play today?	Kita akan main apa hari ini?	3
12	Oh, the street is so jumped	Jalanannya macet sekali	2
13	I'm gonna be late	Aku bisa terlambat!	3
14	There was an accident in the crossroad	Ada kecelakaan di persimpangan jalan	3
15	I heard a car skidded	Aku dengar sebuah Mobil tergelincir	2
16	That's way this jammed traffic	Itulah yang menyebabkan kemacetan	3
17	An accident?	Kecelakaan?	3
18	Oh no!	Oh, tidak!	3
19	Dory must be waiting	Dory pasti sedang menungguku.	3
20	Why isn't tayo coming?	Mengapa tayo belum datang?	3
21	Dory	Dory!	3
22	It's time to go home	Waktunya pulang	3
23	But tayo isn't here yet mother	Tapi, tayo belum datang bu	3
24	But is to late	Tapi hari sudah petang	3
25	Let's go now	Ayo kita pulang	3
26	Ok	Baiklah	3
27	Dory is not here	Dory tidak disini	3
28	He must to be left because I'm to late	Dia pasti sudah pergi ,Karena aku terlambat	3
29	I'm so sorry	Aku minta maaf	3
30	The street was so packed so I can't move	Jalannya sangat macet kemarin	3
31	I waited for so long	Aku menunggumu sangat lama!	2
32	I'll do anything that you wants to	Aku akan melakukannya apapun yang kau mau	2
33	Anything?	Apapun?	3
34	Yeah	Ya	3
35	Then..	Kalau begitu..	3
36	Can you make me ride a firetruck	Bolehkah aku naik mobil Pemadam kebakaran?	3
37	a firetruck?	Mobil pemadam kebakaran?	3
38	Ya	Ya	3
39	I learned that in the kindergarten	Aku belajar itu di TK	3
40	I wanna ride it so badly	Dan aku sangat ingin menaikinya	3

41	I see, Ok	Aku mengerti, Baiklah.	3
42	Really? I can go to ride the firetruck?	Sungguh? Aku boleh menaikinya?	3
43	Sure , it should be fine	Tentu saja boleh.	3
44	I'll just have to ask help's frank	Aku hanya harus Meminta tolong Frank.	2
45	Yeay , I'm so excited!	Hore! Aku senang sekali!	3
46	Dory	Dory!	3
47	Tayo	Tayo!	3
48	How did it go?	Bagaimana rencana kita?	3
49	Did you talk to Frank?	Apakah kau sudah Berbicara dengan Frank?	3
50	Yes	Ya.	3
51	He said who give you a ride at the fire stations tomorrow	Dia bilang akan menemui di Stasiun pemadam kebakaran besok.	3
52	Really?	Sungguh?	3
53	woow	Wow!	3
54	Oh Cool !	Keren!	3
55	I envy you	Aku iri padamu	3
56	Tayo, you are the best. Thank you	Tayo, kau yang terbaik! Terima kasih	3
57	You're welcome	Sama-sama	3
58	Next day, Dory and Tayo	Keeokan harinya, dory dan tayo	3
59	Visit the fire stations to meet Frank	Pergi ke statioun Untuk bertemu frank.	3
60	So, this is the fire stations?	Jadi seperti ini stasiun pemadam kebakarn itu.	3
61	But, I don't see Frank anywhere	Tapi aku tidak melihat Frank disini.	3
62	I guess he must still at work	Mungkin dia masih bekerja.	3
63	We can wait around for little bit	Kita dapat berkeliling sebentar.	2
64	I hope he come soon	Aku berharap dia segera datang.	3
65	Me too	Aku juga berharap begitu.	3
66	Tayo and Dory must be waiting	Tayo dan Dory pasti menungguku.	3

67	I got to hurry	Aku harus cepat!	3
68	Tayo, when is Frank to be here?	Tayo, kapan Frank datang?	3
69	I think he should be coming soon	Sepertinya dia akan segera datang	3
70	Are you sure you were arrange the vow's Frank	Apa kau yakin sudah berbicara dengan Frank?	3
71	Of course	Tentu saja	3
72	It was just wait a little bit longer	Kita hanya harus menunggu sedikit lebih lama	2
73	But he's not coming	Tapi dia tidak datang!	3
74	Dory	Dory	3
75	I'm going home!	Aku pulang saja!	3
76	What?	Apa?	3
77	Dory, let's wait a little more...	Dory, ayo tunggu sebentar lagi...	3
78	Just a little	Sebentar saja	3
79	No	Tidak	3
80	My mother will be worry about me	Ibuku akan khawatir	3
81	Oh no!	Oh tidak!	3
82	Dory seems very disappointed	Dory terlihat sangat kecewa	3
83	I'm back	Aku pulang	3
84	Tayo	Tayo	3
85	You couldn't meet Frank today right?	Kau tidak bertemu Frank hari ini, bukan?	3
86	How do you know?	Bagaimana kau tahu?	3
87	He comes to the repair shop earlier	Dia datang ke bengkel lebih awal	3
88	He have an accident from slipping on the road	Dia kecelakaan karena tergelincir di jalan	3
89	That's way!	Oh, begirunya!	3
90	I will do explain that to Dorry tomorrow	Aku harus menjelaskan ini pada dory besok	3
91	But this is a little weird	Tapi ini aneh	3
92	Frank is never been held like this before	Frank tidak pernah mengalami hal ini sebelumnya	3
93	Dory. Dory	Dory! Dory!	3
94	What's up Tayo?	Ada apa tayo?	3

95	Frank couldn't come yesterday because he have an accident	Frank tidak bisa datang kemaren karena kecelakaan	3
96	An accident?	Kecelakaan?	3
97	Yes, you must be really disappointed	Ya, kau pasti sangat kecewa	3
98	Little	Sedikit	3
99	Then ,why you don't ask I a different car?	Bagaimana jika kutawarkan mobil yang lain	2
100	A different car?	Mobil yang lain?	3
101	Yes	Ya	3
102	How about the police car?	Bagaimana kalau mobil polisi?	3
103	Wow! That's sounds great	Wow! Sepertinya menyenangkan	3
104	I'm a close friend with Pat too	Aku juga temen dekat Pat.	3
105	I beg him do help us if I ask him	Dia pasti mau membantu	3
106	Are you sure about this?	Apa kau yakin kali ini?	3
107	Of course. Don't you worry	Tentu saja. Jangan khawatir	3
108	OK	Baiklah	3
109	Then meet me here after my class	Temui aku disini sepulang sekolah	3
110	It is deal	Setuju	3
111	Dory!	Dory!	3
112	Guys	Teman-teman	3
113	Did you ride the fire truck?	Kau sudah menaiki mobil pemadam kebakaran?	3
114	How is it?	Bagaimana rasanya?	3
115	Actually, I didn't get a ride it.	Sebenarnya, aku tidak jadi menaikinya	3
116	Why not?	Mengapa?	3
117	You made me excited too	Kau membuatku senang juga	2
118	Did lie us Dory?	Apa kau bohong pada kami dory?	3
119	What?	Apa?	3
120	You didn't say that yesterday	Kau tidak mengatakannya kemaren	3
121	I didn't lie!	Aku tidak bohong!	3
123	Frank has an accident	Frank kecelakaan kemaren	3
124	I get a ride a police car instead	Sebagai gantinya, aku akan naik mobil polisi	3
125	Police car?	Mobil polisi?	3
126	Really?	Benarkah?	3
127	Yes. I'll be meeting him later.	Ya. Aku akan menemuinya nanti	3

128	You can come too. If don't believe me.	Datang saja jika kalian tidak percaya padaku	3
129	Really? Yeay	Benarkah? Hore	3
130	Tayo. You have to bring him this time.	Tayo. Kau harus membawanya kali ini.	3
131	Tayo the little bus.	Tayo. Si bus kecil	3
132	You want me to give Dory a ride ?	Kau ingin aku memberi tumpangan untuk Dory?	3
133	Just for a moments	Ya. Hanya sebentar	3
134	Alright. If it just a moment	Baiklah jika itu hanya sebentar	3
135	Yeay. Thank you	Hore. Terima kasih	3
136	Pat	Pat	3
137	There is an accident in the cross road	Ada kecelakaan di persimpangan jalan	3
138	What?	Apa?	3
139	Some cars slip again	Beberapa mobil tergelincir lagi	3
140	I don't know why such accident happens so oftenly	Aku tidak mengerti mengapa banyak yang tergelincir akhir-akhir ini	2
141	I'm sorry Tayo	Maaf tayo!	3
142	I'll do a vail in the next time	Aku akan membantu lain waktu	3
143	Let's go	Ayo jalan!	3
144	OK	Ayo	3
145	Oh Pat. What should I do?	Oh, Pat. Bagaimana ini?	3
146	Dory will be disappointed again	Dory akan kecewa lagi	3
147	I have to ask some other cars.	Aku harus menawarkan mobil yang lain	3