



Students' Perception of Using Translanguaging Strategies in EFL Class Discussion

Meliya Sari¹, Syafryadin Syafryadin²

Student, English Education Department (Universitas Negeri Bengkulu, Indonesia)^{1*}

English Education Department (Universitas Negeri Bengkulu, Indonesia)²

Article Information

Received: May 30, 2024

Revised: November 12, 2024

Accepted: November 19, 2024

Published: December 02, 2024

Keywords

English Class Discussion; Students' Perceptions; Translanguaging Strategies

Correspondence

E-mail: meliyasari2022@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Many EFL students struggle to participate actively in classroom discussions due to limited proficiency in English, which can hinder their ability to fully engage and learn. The purpose of this study is to investigate students' perceptions of language translation techniques used in EFL classroom discussions. The methodological technique used in this study is qualitative. Using qualitative descriptive methodologies, study data was gathered through interviews. Ten XI-grade students from a senior high school in Bengkulu were the subjects of the interview process. According to the results, students feel more at ease in class when their teachers employ translanguaging because it allows them to interact in two languages during class discussions, communicate with teachers effectively, engage in more engaging learning activities, and pick up new vocabulary. While some students acknowledged that they had trouble understanding teachers when they spoke in English, the majority of them understood the significance of English.

INTRODUCTION

Those who speak many languages and come from different cultural backgrounds are becoming more and more frequent, and one country where this is evident is Indonesia. Speaking in various languages is a common communication tactic in multilingual societies. Since education should be about acquiring knowledge, not just learning English, Velasco & Fialais (2018) stated that the use of multiple languages in the classroom may actually force us to confront the communication problem, but it also has the potential to support students' learning, depending on their needs and the teacher's goals or lesson objectives. Hence, translanguaging is among the greatest ways to convey this idea; nevertheless, it may be lost if students are unable to embrace or accept this pedagogical decision.

In the learning exercises, strategies play a big part. The way the teacher delivers the material in the classroom determines whether or not the learning activities are successful. Every educator needs to have the most appropriate approach for them. To increase the efficacy of language learning, especially for English as a foreign language, teachers can use the pedagogical strategy known as translanguaging in bilingual or multilingual classrooms. According to Atmowardoyo, Weda & Sakkir (2021); Sakkir & Abduh (2022); and Weda (2023), the optimal method for imparting content to students is to optimize their learning, minimize expenses and waste, increase their motivation, and encourage their creativity.

Translanguaging is a pedagogical strategy that educators may use in bilingual or multilingual classrooms, such as those in Indonesia (Rodriquez et al., 2014; Muis, 2023), to enhance language acquisition when teaching English to foreigners Khojan & Ambele (2022). Translanguaging generally refers to allowing students to use their native language proficiency to facilitate language acquisition in a classroom that prioritizes the target language. The word "translanguaging," originally coined in Welsh by Williams (1994), refers to a pedagogical approach to bilingual education wherein the input and output languages are intentionally altered Garcia & Lin (2017). Translanguaging, according to Baker (2011), is a teaching strategy in which a lesson or text is initially given in one language, but further work—like writing, conversation, or finishing a worksheet done in a different language.

The majority of EFL students struggle since English is not their first language, while some, like those in Indonesia, are sufficiently fluent in the language Atmowardoyo & Sakkir (2021). Sahib (2019) claims that students who have trouble speaking English may choose to keep quiet while they study. Thus, translanguaging might be the best solution. Translanguaging can help language learners create conversational techniques and bridge their identities as English language learners and speakers with speakers of their mother tongue, among other benefits. Students will gain from using their home tongue as a beneficial linguistic resource and will learn practical strategies to communicate in English.

A number of recent studies by Khairunnisa & Lukmana (2020); Rasman (2018); Rerung (2015); and Santoso (2020) have looked into teachers' opinions about translanguaging in ELT. Also covered in earlier research by Nursanti (2016); and Santoso (2019) was the

cross-linguistic pedagogy of Indonesian students' perspectives. However, there is very little research on translanguaging in Indonesia. Putrawan (2022) explains that there were only 3 studies that had been conducted on translanguaging in Indonesia. Moreover, of the 3 studies, only three studies conducted their research in junior high schools. The three studies were conducted by Sahib, Ukka, Nawing, & Sari (2020) in Manokwari, Rasman (2018) in Yogyakarta, and Sapitri, Gede, & Myartawan (2018) in Singaraja.

Research on translanguaging in senior high schools in Bengkulu Utara has not yet been carried out. On the other hand, the purpose of this study is to investigate the use of translanguaging at a senior high school located in Bangkulu Utara. This study investigated how the students perceive translanguaging in an EFL class discussion. This study looked into how students felt about the translanguaging process during a discussion in an EFL lesson. The purpose of this study is to provide an answer to the query, "*How do students perceive translanguaging in Bengkulu Utara's high school?*"

Translanguaging

Translanguaging is a novel approach to teaching and studying second languages that was initially implemented in Welsh by educators in that language. Jenks and Lee (2020) assert that translanguaging and translanguaging are recognized as important ideas in language and communication. It's characterized as a method where pupils are encouraged to speak in their native tongue, giving language learning purpose Ortega (2019). Translanguaging has been considered a useful method of instruction in the fields of multilingualism and bilingualism. Translanguaging practices in bilingualism were demonstrated around the end of the 20th century when youngsters were encouraged to interact in both languages in a single setting. As a result of the advancement, translanguaging gained popularity in language learning programs, which is advantageous for English language schools as well. According to Cook (2001) in his opinion, connecting and expanding linguistic knowledge with the target language can be facilitated for students by utilizing their mother tongue in an English classroom. In the English language classroom, translanguaging is a strategy that has been shown to provide advantages and benefits for language learners.

Perceptions of Students

Students are the main participants in the classroom. Their views and ideas regarding instructional strategies are important. In order to determine the efficacy and feasibility of instructional strategies, researchers typically examine the perspectives of learners within the classroom. According to Kitjaroonchai (2019) set out to examine how Thai students perceived the use of their mother tongue (L1), Thai, in English classrooms. She discovered that although most students preferred to use English in the classroom, most thought that using L1 had some benefits for delineating new vocabulary, explaining complex grammatical points, and elucidating complex concepts or ideas. As a result, students should utilize their native tongue appropriately, and their opinions about translanguaging should be taken into consideration while modifying its application. Therefore, in order to identify practical strategies for implementing translanguaging in the EFL classroom discussion, this study focuses on the perceptions of students.

RESEARCH METHOD

In this study, qualitative research methods were employed. A qualitative descriptive research methodology was also used in this study. Studying language phenomena, in particular, the usage of L1 and L2 in translanguaging in an EFL classroom, has been the focus of this type of research. Also, in order to address the research issue of students' perceptions of the practice of translanguaging, the descriptive qualitative approach in this study was employed to explain the data collected in the form of a collection of words.

The research location is a high school in Bengkulu Utara. The participants of this research will be 10 students in the X1 IPS grade of the school. The researcher used a purposive sampling technique to select the participants in the research. The students selected were those who were considered active in class and had better English skills than most of their classmates.

To collect data for this study, interviews were used as the instrument. In order to obtain a more thorough grasp of students' perceptions of translanguaging, this measure was selected for the study. To gather data from students, the researcher used a semi-structured interviewing

method. In order to help with data collection, the researcher also used voice recording and field notes.

The data of this research was analyzed by using thematic analysis. The data analysis process was founded on the six principles proposed by Braun & Clarke (2006) for thematic analysis activities, namely:

Familiarizing with the data

To begin the data analysis process, familiarize yourself with the data. In this phase, the investigator listened to recordings of observations made in the classroom and reviewed the transcripts of interviews conducted with the instructor and students. The researcher repeatedly read and listened to the data in order to better understand it.

Generating initial codes

The next phase involved the researchers classifying and coding every word, phrase, or concept that surfaced in the data in order to create the first sets of codes. The researcher's observations and analyses of the data served as the foundation for the codes. Utilizing data analysis tools made the coding procedure easier by enabling the researcher to arrange and monitor the codes.

Searching for themes

Following the creation of initial codes, the researchers looked for linkages and patterns within codes to identify themes. After classifying the codes into possible themes, the researcher examined and improved them.

Reviewing themes

By contrasting them with one another, the researchers examined the possible themes. The themes were assessed in terms of how well they represented the data and how pertinent they were to the research topic. The themes that remained would have been further developed and modified as necessary after the ones that did not fit the data well were removed.

Defining and naming themes

Based on their applicability to the study topic, the final themes were identified and given names. The researcher accurately and meaningfully described the themes using his understanding.

Producing the report

The researchers entered data into the report as the last stage. The themes that arose from the researcher's study of the data were provided in the report. To support the chosen themes, the report included specific quotes taken directly from the data.

FINDING AND DISCUSSION

Findings

Students' Perceptions of Translanguaging

Researchers conduct the interviews with ten eleventh grade students in order to collect data. Purposive sampling was used to choose the top 10 active students or those whose English proficiency outperformed that of the majority of their peers. Researchers recorded every student's explanation using audio recordings. An explanation of how students feel about translanguaging use in EFL lessons is provided below:

What advantages did the students experience from the use of translanguaging in the English classroom? was the first question the researcher asked them during their interview process. The excerpt below shows student explanations:

Table 1

Table of the first question answers

NO	QUESTIONS	ANSWERS
1	Students learn English more easily	<i>Ketika guru menggunakan translanguaging dikelas menjadi lebih mudah dipahami pembelajaran bahasa Inggris (When the teachers use Translanguaging in class, English learning become easier to understand. Student 1</i>

Lebih mudah dimengerti (Easier to understand). Student 2

Jadi tidak begitu sulit untuk dimengerti (So, it's not that difficult to understand). Student 3

Jadi lebih mudah (So it's easier). Student 4

Lebih menarik (More interesting). Student 5

Tidak monoton (Not monotonous). Student 6

In the five answers above, it can be seen that the teacher's use of translanguaging makes learning English easier for students. In the first answer, the student said that using translanguaging made it easier for him to learn English and understand the learning material. In the explanation, the second and third students also explained the same thing. She explained that it was easier for her to learn English by translanguaging. In the fourth and fifth students' explanations, learning English using translanguaging in class can be more interesting and not monotonous.

Translanguaging helps students feel more at ease in English classes, according to the findings of the student interviews. This is demonstrated in the excerpt that follows:

Table 2

Table of the second questions

NO	QUESTIONS	ANSWERS
2	Students feel comfortable in class	<p><i>Nyaman, karena membuat tidak susah memahaaminya</i> (It is convenient because it doesn't make it difficult to understand). Student 7</p> <p><i>Betul, membuat nyaman karena dapat menggunakan 2 bahasa</i> (That's right, it makes us comfortable because can use 2 language). Students 8</p>

These two responses demonstrate how translanguaging helps students feel more at ease while learning English. In the first response, the student said that he was at ease and that learning English was not too tough for him because he could readily understand the meaning of words in Indonesian. The student said in his second response that he felt at ease since he believed studying English would be simpler if he spoke two languages.

Based on the results of the student interviews, **the researcher discovered that successful communication between teachers and students can be achieved in the classroom through the use of translanguaging**. As you can see from the excerpt below:

Table 3

Table of the third question answers

NO	QUESTIONS	ANSWERS
3	Effective communication with the teacher	<p><i>Iya, karena bisa nyambung berkomunikasi dengan guru langsung (Yes,because you can communicate directly with the teacher). Student 9</i></p> <p><i>Jadi tidak bosan belajar bahasa inggris karena bisa langsung berinteraksi dengan guru didalam kelas dengan menggunakan translanguaging atau mix bahasa (So you don't get bored learning English because you can directly interact with the teacher in the classroom by using translanguaging or mixing languages.) Student 10</i></p>

Language translation can facilitate more fruitful communication between teachers and students, as demonstrated in the quote above. The student in the quote states that she can communicate with the teacher directly more successfully because she can better understand what the teacher is saying because Indonesian is used together with English in English lessons, and so she doesn't get bored learning English because she can directly interact with the teacher. In the classroom by using translanguaging or mixing languages.

The findings of the student interview indicate that **when a teacher employs translanguaging in the classroom, students are more eager to participate in the learning process**. The following excerpt shows the student explanations

Table 4

Table of fourth question answers

NO	QUESTIONS	ANSWERS
4	Students are more interested in learning	<p><i>Sangat tertarik karena guru mengajari bagaimana cara berkomunikasi dalam bahasa inggris (Very interested because the teacher teaches how to communicate in English). Student 1</i></p> <p><i>Betul, menarik karena menggunakan dua bahasa (That's right, it's interesting because it uses two languages). Student 2</i></p>

Based on the two answers above, the use of translanguaging can help students become more involved in their education. The student said in the first answer that he was very interested because the teacher taught him how to communicate in English. He was interested because he could learn how to communicate in English in class by using two languages or translanguaging. In addition, the student explained in the second answer that he was attractive because he spoke two languages.

The study discovered that **using translanguaging in the classroom helps students' vocabulary grow in English based on the findings of the student interviews**. This is demonstrated in the excerpt that follows:

Table 5

Table of fifth question answers

NO	QUESTIONS	ANSWERS
5	Students can add new vocabulary	<p><i>Saya jadi bisa mendapatkan banyak kosa kat baru (So I was able to get a lot of new vocabulary). Student 3</i></p> <p><i>Kosa kata baru dapat saya temukan di dalam diskusi kelas (I can find new vocabulary in class discussions). Student 4</i></p>

It can be seen from the two answers above that students can expand their vocabulary by using teacher's Translanguaging. The student said in the first answer that she could get a lot of new vocabulary through language translation. Likewise, in the second answer, she explained the new vocabulary she could find in class discussions.

During the interview, the researcher inquired if the students **had any challenges when utilizing translanguaging for learning**. Here is an excerpt showing the students' responses:

Table 6

Table fo sixth question answers

NO	QUESTIONS	ANSWERS
6	Difficulties in using translanguaging	<p><i>Tidak, justru menggunakan translanguaging sangat membantu kami. Bisa menggunakan bahasa inggris dan bahasa Indonesia (Not, actually using transalanguaging really help us. We can use English and Indonesian). Student 5</i></p> <p><i>Ada beberapa hal yang membuat susah dimengerti karena guru menggunakan bahsa Inggris (The are several things that make it difficult to understand because the teacher uses English). Student 6</i></p>

Tidak sulit, menggunakan translanguaging membuat belajar lebih asik (It's not difficult, using translanguaging make learning more be fun). Students 7

The researcher found students' opinions about the challenges they might face when using language translation in the classroom in the excerpt from the interview findings above. The student stated in the first answer that he actually used translanguaging which really helped us to be able to use English and Indonesian. However, the student admitted in the second quote that he had some things that were difficult to understand because the teacher used English. However, the last student responded that it was not difficult, using translanguaging made learning more fun.

The researcher questioned students **their opinions regarding the importance of translanguaging in English classes** in the final question of the interview process. Here, the following excerpt displays the pupils' responses:

Table 7

Table of seventh question answers

NO	QUESTIONS	ANSWERS
7	The importance of translanguaging	<i>Menggunakan translanguaging didalam proses pembelajaran dikelas memang sangat membantu dan penting, tp jika ingin lebih fokus berbahasa inggris maka harus sering melatih full bahasa inggris</i> (Using translanguaging in the classroom learning process is very helpful and important, but if you want to focus more on English then you have to practice full English often). Student 8

Sangat penting, karena karena bisa membuat lebih mengerti dan membuat saya percaya diri untuk berbicara bahasa inggris didepan kelas (It is very important, because it can make me understand better and make me confident to speak English in front of the class). Student 9

Various perspectives regarding the importance of language translation in the English learning process were revealed from student interview findings. For example, the use of translanguaging in the learning process in class is very helpful and important, but if you want to focus more on English then you must often practice full English in the first answer. He stated that using English in class regularly will help students concentrate on learning the language. She said that translanguaging is very important in the English learning process, in contrast to the students in the second answer. She clarified that language translation is very important, because it can make me understand better and make me confident to speak English in front of the class.

Discussion

These results came from ten grade XI pupils that were interviewed. Based on the findings of the interviews, students felt that translanguaging helped them learn English more quickly; it also made them feel more at ease in the classroom, improved their ability to communicate with the teacher, increased their enthusiasm in learning, and allowed them to expand their vocabulary. Students' opinions of the challenges they encountered when using translanguaging and their assessment of its significance were also inquired about by the researcher.

First, the results demonstrate that teachers' translanguaging efforts help pupils acquire English that is engaging, easy to grasp, and does not become boring. According Per Liando et al. (2022)'s interview results, all five students believed that language translation enhanced their English class experience. Teachers can improve their students' learning and comprehension of the curriculum by implementing language translation in the classroom. Baker (2011) noted

that encouraging students to have a deeper and more thorough comprehension of the material is one of the advantages of utilizing translanguaging in classroom discussion. Further findings that students feel at ease using translanguaging in English classes. On this, both pupils agreed. Students feel at ease when they utilize language translation because translanguaging makes it simple for them to comprehend the context of conversations when they use English and Indonesian to communicate in class. This explains what Khairunnisa and Lukmana (2020) said, which was that translanguaging helps students feel at ease in the classroom. According to their explanation, students who speak Indonesian or a familiar language in English classes might reduce their anxiety levels and make the classroom feel less intimidating because they are unable to speak the target language.

According to the findings of the student interviews, both students felt that when a teacher uses translanguaging in the classroom, students may interact and speak with the teacher directly, which can improve the effectiveness of their communication with the teacher. In 2023, Ariyani et al. This is so that, in comparison to teachers who utilize English as a whole in the classroom, students who translanguaging are better able to comprehend the language teacher's instructions. Language translation helps reduce barriers to communication that occur when pupils don't fully understand English. Anwar (2019) explains that translanguaging is a method that can support foreign language learning activities for both teachers and students. This entails switching from speaking in a single language to speaking in several languages in order to improve the effectiveness of teacher-student communication. Students' engagement in the learning process was found to be positively impacted by the usage of translanguaging according to the findings of student interviews. When asked about their level of interest, both of the students who were questioned said that it was because the teacher had taught them how to speak in English. If the teacher employed translanguaging when instructing, the students would be more engaged in the material. One student claimed that he was motivated to learn since the teacher had taught him how to speak in English through language translation. This illustrates how using language translation aids students not just in learning the content but also in improving their general proficiency in English. This is also the result of research by Darlene (2018), who found that students will become more engaged in the material and feel

less stressed when using a second language (L2) if they practice their language skills more and use their first language (L1) as support.

Riswanto (2022) stated findings that show the potential benefits of translanguaging for students in understanding new English terminology. The use of translanguaging helps students' vocabulary develop, according to each student's answer in the interview results. Educators can help students understand the context and meaning of English vocabulary by using translanguaging. According to Bin-Tahir et al. (2018), this is consistent with the findings of Saputra (2015), who found that students supported the use of translanguaging in class because they believed it would make it easier for them to learn new terminology. The researcher interviewed three students in interviews about the challenges they faced when their teachers implemented language translation in the classroom. All three students said they had no difficulty at all. In fact, when teachers apply translanguaging during learning and discussions in class it becomes more interesting and easier to understand in the learning process. Learning English is more fun and relaxed by using two languages. Students understand the English context better when the teacher explains learning material in Indonesian and English. However, the challenges faced by the above students indicate that some students may need additional help in adjusting to the change from Indonesian to English.

Regarding the importance of translanguaging in English language acquisition, students' opinions were mixed, in line with previous findings. Translating is essential to learning English, according to two out of ten students surveyed. They are of the opinion that implementing translanguaging Using translanguaging in the classroom learning process is very helpful and important, but if you want to focus more on English then you have to practice full English often. At the same time, a student said that translanguaging was very important, because it could make me understand better and make me confident to speak English in front of the class. They argue that using English consistently is important if the main goal is to concentrate on learning the language. The student responses above show their varying opinions regarding the best teaching methods for English classes.

CONCLUSION

The use of translanguaging in the classroom to enhance learning is generally viewed favorably by students, based on findings and discussions. Students feel that learning English becomes easier by translanguaging; they may add new terminology, feel more comfortable in class, and communicate with teachers more effectively. Although only a few students admitted to having difficulty with the teacher's use of language translation, if they wanted to focus more on English, they might have studied it more deeply, but most of them understood how important this was to improve their English proficiency, adding a lot of new vocabulary. and increasing students' sense of self-confidence when conducting discussions in front of the class by using translanguaging. Training them is much more active and fun.

REFERENCES

- Anwar, W. P. (2019). *Exploring translanguaging: An approach to teaching and learning English as foreign language of Bone Islamic university context* (Doctoral dissertation, UNIVERSITAS NEGERI MAKASSAR).
- Ariyani, A., Muhayyang, M., Munir, M., & Sakkir, G. (2023). Students' voices: Poster session as an alternative way of teaching writing. *ARRUS Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities*, 3(2), 97-103.
- Atmowardoyo, H., & Sakkir, G. (2021, November). The Development of language learning theory based on best practice: A Literature Review. In *Proceedings of the Tenth International Conference on Languages and Arts (ICLA 2021)* (pp. 172-184). Atlantis Press.
- Atmowardoyo, H., Weda, S., & Sakkir, G. (2021). Learning Strategies in English Skills used by Good Language Learners in Millennial Era: A Positive Case Study in Universitas Negeri Makassar. *ELT Worldwide*, 8(1), 28-40.

- Atmowardoyo, H., Weda, S., & Sakkir, G. (2021). Learning Strategies in English Skills used by Good Language Learners in Millennial Era: A Positive Case Study in Universitas Negeri Makassar. *ELT Worldwide*, 8(1), 28-40.
- Baker, C. (2011). *Foundations of bilingual education and bilingualism*. Multilingual matters.
- Bin-Tahir, S. Z., Saidah, U., Mufidah, N., & Bugis, R. (2018). The impact of translanguaging approach on teaching Arabic reading in a multilingual classroom. *Ijaz Arabi Journal of Arabic Learning*, 1(1).
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative research in psychology*, 3(2), 77-101.
- Cook, V. (2001). Using the first language in the classroom. *Canadian modern language review*, 57(3), 402-423.
- Darlene, Y. (2018). *Translanguaging in the Japanese tertiary context: Student perceptions and pedagogical implications* (Doctoral dissertation, Niigata University of International and Information Studies).
- García, O., & Lin, A. M. (2017). Translanguaging in bilingual education. *Bilingual and multilingual education*, 117-130.
- Jenks, C., & Lee, J. W. (2020). Translanguaging and world Englishes. *World Englishes*, 39(2), 218-221.
- Khairunnisa, K., & Lukmana, I. (2020). Teachers' attitudes towards translanguaging in Indonesian EFL classrooms. *Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan*, 20(2), 254-266.
- Khojan, S., & Ambele, E. A. (2022). *Teachers' Perceptions and Practices of Translanguaging in Thai EFL Classroom* (Doctoral dissertation, Mahasarakham University).
- Kitjaroonchai, T., & Lampadan, R. M. (2016). Perceptions of Students towards the Use of Thai in English Classrooms. *Catalyst*, 13(1).

- Liando, N. V., Tatipang, D. P., & Lengkoan, F. (2022). A study of translanguaging practices in an EFL classroom in Indonesian context: A multilingual concept. *Research and Innovation in Language Learning*, 5(2), 167-185.
- Ortega, L. (2019). SLA and the study of equitable multilingualism. *The Modern Language Journal*, 103, 23-38.
- Putrawan, G. E. (2022). Translanguaging practices in efl classrooms: evidence from indonesia. *CaLLs (Journal of Culture, Arts, Literature, and Linguistics)*, 8(1), 69-86.
- Putrawan, G. E. (2022). Translanguaging practices in efl classrooms: evidence from indonesia. *CaLLs (Journal of Culture, Arts, Literature, and Linguistics)*, 8(1), 69-86.
- Riswanto, R. (2022). Exploring translanguaging as a pedagogical strategy used by the english teacher in EFL classroom setting. *Jurnal Penelitian Guru Indonesia*, 7(1), 96-103.
- Rodríguez, D., Carrasquillo, A., & Lee, K. S. (2014). *The bilingual advantage: Promoting academic development, biliteracy, and native language in the classroom*. Teachers College Press.
- Sahib, R. B. (2019). The Use of Translanguaging as A Pedagogical Strategy in EFL Classroom: A Case Study at Bulukumba Regency. *LET: Linguistics, Literature and English Teaching Journal*, 9(2), 154-180.
- Saputra, U. R., Maulina, M., Nasrullah, R., & Sakkir, G. (2021). Students' Sentence Errors on WhatsApp Daily Status: A Literature Review. *Celebes Journal of Language Studies*, 23-31.
- Velasco, P., & Fialais, V. (2018). Moments of metalinguistic awareness in a Kindergarten class: Translanguaging for simultaneous biliterate development. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 21(6), 760-774.

Williams, C. (2002). *Ennill iaith: Astudiaeth o sefyllfa drochi yn 11 - 16 oed* [A Language Gained: A Study of Language Immersion at 11-16 years of age]. Bangor, UK: School of Education.